

AGENDA  
LIVING WAGE ADVISORY BOARD MEETING  
December 5, 2018 - 11:00 a.m.  
**Room 302**

- I. Call to Order and roll call.
- II. Introductions as necessary.
- III. Approval of October 3, 2018 minutes.
- IV. Staff updates to report.
- V. Updates from Board members on meetings with Commissioners regarding the Living Wage.
- VI. Discussion and instruction to staff.
- VII. Adjourn.

**MINUTES**  
**LIVING WAGE ADVISORY BOARD MEETING**  
**Wednesday, October 3, 2018 - 11:00 a.m.**

**Living Wage Advisory Board Members Present:**

Zac Cassidy, Chair  
James Ryan, Vice Chair  
Mark Klein, Board Member  
Frank De Risi, Board Member  
Mike D. Payne, Board Member  
Chester Just, Board Member

**Living Wage Advisory Board Members Absent:**

**County Staff Present:**

Glenn Marcos, Assistant Director, Purchasing Division  
Connie Mangan, Purchasing Manager, Purchasing Division  
Lucy Garcia, Minutes Coordinator, Purchasing Division

- I. The Minutes Coordinator, Lucy Garcia called the meeting to order at 11:10 a.m. Roll call was conducted by Lucy Garcia and it was noted a quorum was present.
- II. Introductions were made by Advisory Board members and County staff. In addition, a LWAB member invited a guest who attended the meeting: Joy Smith, an Airport Employee for Menzies Aviation, at Fort Lauderdale Hollywood International Airport. A copy of the agenda and minutes were provided to the guest speaker.
- III. **A motion was made by Mike Payne, seconded by Mark Klein and unanimously passed to accept the August 1, 2018 minutes.**
- IV. Staff Updates:
  - A. Connie Mangan briefly discussed the Living Wage Contracts Reports for the August, 2018 – September, 2018 reporting period. There were four living wage contracts awarded in August, 2018 – September, 2018. Further clarification will be provided on the data provided by the vendor for the Water Meter Reading Services contract. Glenn Marcos also provided the Living Wage Advisory Board members with further clarification on the exemption portion of the report.
  - B. The report provided by HR, will be addressed at the next meeting, if applicable.
- V. Updates from Board members on meetings with Commissioners regarding the Living Wage:
  - A. Mike Payne provided an update on his debriefing meeting with Commissioner Holness; the details are provided under the discussion section of the minutes.  
  
There were no other updates provided at this time.
- VI. Discussion:
  - A. Glenn Marcos provided an update on the ongoing activity and discussions regarding increasing the Living Wage rates. The discussion by the Commissioners, during the Commission Board Meeting, to increase the Living Wage rate to \$12.99 or \$13.27. The current rate is \$12.38. The County Administrator has recommended increasing it to \$12.99, with medical [rate if employer offers healthcare benefits]; Commissioner Nan Rich has recommended increasing it to \$13.27 with medical. The FY19 Budget reflects the budget impact for an increase to \$12.99 including medical. The item will be coming back to the Commissioners for a vote. A Workshop has also been scheduled for October 16<sup>th</sup>. There will be a significant impact to the County's Budget for an additional Homestead Exemption that is being addressed by an upcoming referendum in November. This will affect the County's revenue. The Board Members and staff had a lengthy discussion how this impacts the County. They also discussed the methods and formulas used to calculate the living wage rates. Broward County is unique and stands on its own merits and should not be compared to other counties. Mark Klein asked if there were any discussions on the percentage of healthcare. Glenn Marcos indicated that the County will increase as required by the ordinance; \$12.99 with health benefits and then indexing will remain the same. Chester Just requested clarification on how the healthcare portion is evaluated and determine if the employer is providing benefits. Connie Mangan provided clarification that the employer provides documentation and invoices which are the minimum requirements. Glenn Marcos discussed the current analysis that was conducted by HR, on three different types of plans to purchase through the Affordable Care Act.

- B. During the meeting, there was a question posed by the guest speaker to Staff, but after clarification it was suggested that the guest be introduced by Mike Payne, Board Member, to the other Advisory Board members; guest speakers are not allowed to ask questions to the Advisory Board but they are allowed, at the discretion of the Advisory Board Members, to address the Board with their concerns. Mike Payne advised the Advisory Board Members that during his debriefing discussion with his Commissioner, Dale Holness, the conversation came up regarding the loophole and employee declinations. Commissioner Holness brought up the concerns of Joy Smith, an airport employee and asked Mike to meet with her and listen to her concerns. After that discussion, Mike asked her to come to the Advisory Board meeting to voice her concerns to the Board Members. The Advisory Board members agreed to listen to her concerns and Mike advised the guest speaker that the Board Members are not obligated to answer any questions.

Joy Smith, an employee of Menzies Aviation (Menzies) at the Airport, introduced herself and gave a lengthy detail of her concerns regarding her interactions with the Union and her employer, Menzies. She has been an employee of Menzies since November, 2016; there was no union at that time. Menzies then signed a United Service Workers Union – Local 74 agreement in June, 2016. Employees were provided copies of the agreement in December 2016, six months after, with no selection on behalf of the employees. She is currently working full time hours, but is classified as part-time employee with no benefits, sick time or vacation time. The company presented a form in November for the employees to decline insurance, with no explanation. They [employees] were not provided an opportunity to choose an insurance plan and had no representation from the union. She went ahead purchased insurance from the Affordable Healthcare exchange marketplace. She filed a complaint with Broward County [Professional Standards/Human Rights Section] after collecting signatures and filed it in January of 2018. She has not received a response. She also filed a complaint with Menzies' HR with the other workers to remove their names off the Union membership list, since they do not come in to represent them. Menzies' HR is the one that provides the membership card to sign up for the Union. She also filed a charge with the National Labor Board against the Union and Menzies for mistreatment and being investigated by the National Mediation Board for investigation. Ms. Smith indicated that she has clocked 2,000 hours for the year but is being paid as a part-time employee with no benefits.

Mark Klein, Board Member, thanked her for coming to the meeting and voicing her concerns. She definitely has a Union and company problem. He did state that her concerns regarding her current situation, working as a full-time employee but getting part-time benefits is against the Living Wage Ordinance. He asked staff regarding the Ordinance that was passed, within the last year, which addressed any workers at the airport would fall under the Living Wage Ordinance. Staff responded that it would depend on the number of hours worked for an employee. He addressed the loophole, that the Advisory Board has been concerned about regarding the declination of insurance. He stressed that this should not be tolerated by the Union, County and this Advisory Board. Mike Payne voiced his dismay at the boldness of this company taking advantage of its workers when it comes to their practices on policies and benefits for their employees. Jim Ryan also suggested that the Commissioners be advised of this situation so the company can be investigated. Frank DeRisi discussed the paper trail and how they are getting away with these practices, perhaps a letter can be addressed to the Board advising of the allegations. Connie Mangan advised the Advisory Board members that any complaints regarding living wage should be filed with the Office of Professional Standards. They handle and investigate these types of complaints. Ms. Smith advised the Advisory Board Members that she filed the complaint with the County in Room 426 with a Ms. Smith and was advised that she had retired.

The Advisory Board Members continued this lengthy discussion and agreed that the Advisory Board can only focus on any issues with the Living Wage Ordinance and not any issues with the Union. The Advisory Board members discussed the Living Wage issues that have been voiced by Ms. Smith. The Board Members recommended that Ms. Smith return to the Office of Professional Standards and follow-up with her filed complaint. Glenn Marcos reiterated the multiple issues voiced by Ms. Smith and once again suggested that Ms. Smith should go back to Professional Standards, follow-up on her complaint so they can investigate and render a decision. The Board Members determined, after discussion, that Ms. Smith is being paid the correct living wage rate for declining the health plan but the problem is she was not offered any options to choose any other health plans. Staff clarified that these contracts are not bid through the County, but directly secured by the Airlines and the Airport. The Advisory Board members once again discussed their past concerns with the loophole in the ordinance. Staff does recall that the issue of the loophole has been discussed at a Budget Hearing by one of the Commissioners; overall they are focusing on the increasing the living wage rate.

**MINUTES, LIVING WAGE ADVISORY BOARD MEETING**  
**Wednesday, October 3, 2018 - 11:00 a.m.**

Page 2

The Advisory Board members discussed getting an update of the Professional Standards determination and asked that Ms. Smith return, if possible at the next scheduled meeting to give an update. They also discussed providing an examples of this case at their respective briefings with their Commissioners or perhaps draft a letter to the Commissioners. The Board Members agreed that they will wait until Professional Standards renders their findings and Ms. Smith can return to the next scheduled meeting with that update.

Instruction to Staff:

A. There was no further instruction given to Staff at this meeting.

VII. There being no further business before the Board, the meeting adjourned at 12:40 p.m. (noon).

This meeting was recorded on CD 18-SC-80 (Sony IC Recorder).

**Hand-Outs at the 10/3/18 Meeting:**

1. Updated Living Wage Contracts Report.
2. Attendance Record.
3. Schedule of Living Wage Advisory Board Meetings for 2018.



**Broward County Living Wage Ordinance: New Living Wage Contracts (Effective for the Period October through November 2018)**

Item:	Bid/RL/ RFP No.:	Description/ Title:	Vendor/ Contractor Name:	Award Date:	Effective Date:	New Estimated Contract Value Annual:	Previous Estimated Contract Value	Comments:	Reporting	Contract Increases	
									Exemption:	Living Wage	Scope Changes
	PNC211724581_1	Fabricate&Refurb Control Panel	CHAMPION CONTROLS INC.	11/13/2018	12/8/2018	\$1,167,173	\$925,989	Single bidder. Open-end contract to single bidder, Champion Controls, Inc., a certified County Business Enterprise, for Fabricate and Refurbish Lift Station Control Panels, Bid No. PNC2117245B1, for Water and Wastewater Services, in the annual estimated amount of \$1,167,173, which includes allowances in the amount of \$22,000, and authorize the Director of Purchasing to renew the contract for two one-year periods, for a three-year potential estimated amount of \$3,501,519. Previous contract: Y1380401B1; \$997,110 expenditures.	Yes	No	Yes



2019  
LIVING WAGE ADVISORY BOARD MEETINGS

*(These are the bi-monthly meetings (First Wednesday of the month) for 2019)*

FEBRUARY 6, 2019

APRIL 3, 2019

JUNE 5, 2019

AUGUST 7, 2019

OCTOBER 2, 2019

DECEMBER 4, 2019